

A Human rights analysis of Cases - Incidents of maternal death and ill-health in nine districts of UP
As presented at Lucknow (UP) on 28 May 2009 by Mahila Swasthya Adhikar Manch and Healthwatch Forum UP

Brief profile	Incident	Health system lapses	Human Rights violation
<p>Case of S. w/o Umesh, 28 years, fourth pregnancy, very poor, Dalit Kushinagar</p>	<p>Maternal death of 15 December 2007 (this is an old case but still very significant)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Had been attending the local PHC for ANC in pregnancy, all her 3 earlier children were born at the PHC • Was well enough to not need a vehicle, went walking 1.5 km towards the PHC during onset of labour • At the PHC at 4 pm met the ANM, no mention of doctor • ANM asked them to buy injections (and a bottle of glucose drip) from the market, when the family enquired she said it was a 'pain enhancing injection' • ANM administered several injections and started an IV line without medical supervision – used a total of 13 injections within four hours • When the woman started screaming as she was feeling very unwell, the ANM slapped her hard several times and scolded her for restraining the labour pains • After a while the ANM asked the family to lift her down from the bed, and asked for payment, saying she should be taken elsewhere (by then she was dead) • The body was taken home in a rickshaw, no vehicle was provided 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When the woman started screaming as she was feeling very unwell after the injections, the ANM slapped her hard several times and scolded her for restraining the labour pains • When the family asked for the services of a doctor, they were informed that there were no doctors • When she had collapsed, the ANM asked the family to lift her down from the bed and take her elsewhere, rather than inform them that she was in a serious condition • The ANM demanded money for her services but took no responsibility for the complication and death • There was no post-mortem • There was no grievance redressal mechanism • There was no compensation to the family and her three children • After the local women's group MSAM and the NGO documented this incident and Healthwatch Forum raised the case with national level officials, there was an enquiry into the matter and the ANM was suspended

<p>Case of M. w/o Ramprasad, very poor, Dalit, 26 years, third pregnancy, extremely poor Mirzapur</p>	<p>Maternal death, 20 Sept 2008</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arrived at the CHC at 8 pm where they met the ANM (no mention of a doctor) • The ANM 'attempted all night to deliver' the baby by sitting on her and pressing her abdomen (fundal pressure) but was unsuccessful • The next day the ANM asked the family to take her to the district hospital on their own (no referral transport support), so woman was taken back home as they had no money • They waited another night with the laboring woman, then the next day (14th) they once again went to the road, wondering how to reach another health facility (no support from the health system) • Finally they went to a private hospital (Shanti hospital) where the doctor was unwilling and was referring them to the district hospital, but upon begging him, he admitted her • Baby was born dead after an injection (no early detection of foetal death) and the blood was appearing in black clots (no complication was detected here) • Woman was taken home, where she was normally eating and moving around for 5 days (no post-partum observation or care from institution) • Once again on 19th she had acute pain in her legs and swelling in her abdomen (no information about or help for post-partum 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The family went to the CHC as they were hoping to benefit from the JSY • The family was extremely poor and did not have the capacity to go to any other hospital except the CHC near their village • There was no information or support for them to access referral institutions, which led to the baby's death (through delayed delivery) • The institutions do not provide emergency care at night, although the rural woman has travelled with great difficulty to reach there • The lack of referral support or information later led to the woman's death (as they went to a practitioner who refused to admit her and handle the complication) • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation to the family
---	-------------------------------------	--	---

		<p>complication)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • After getting transport with great difficulty, they reached the government district hospital 40 Km away at 10 pm, but it was closed • They then took her to a private hospital where the doctor only gave medicines for 250 Rs but refused to admit her (no information about where to go or support for complications) • Then they returned to the government hospital, and after calling out for the staff, sat all night outside the gate • The doctor admitted her at 8 am the next morning, started an IV line and she died at 11 am 	
Case of R. w/o Rajkumar, 26 years, Dalit, second pregnancy, Chandauli	Maternal death on 19 October 2008	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Her first pregnancy was diagnosed as complicated by the ANM at the local PHC so they spent Rs 18,000 on her delivery from a private hospital in Mugalsarai, which pushed them deep into debt • When labour pain started she went by bicycle to the PHC at 2 pm where there were two ANMs (no doctor) • The ANMs said he could not get an admit-slip as it was after 2 pm, and advised him to go buy 3 injections and 3 bottles of glucose for IV, which was administered without supervision of a doctor (he paid for all medicines) • Later at 11 pm, she asked for more injections and glucose, for which he had no more money, so he cycled home for 17 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The family was plunged into debt since the government hospital they attended did not take any responsibility for referral in her first pregnancy • Even during the second delivery, he was asked to make payments for all the medicines and asked to raise more money, for which he had to travel through the forest at night and take loans • The death was not announced, the body was left there, while the ANMs all left the place • His intention was to protest by sitting there with the body, but others didn't think it was a good idea so he cremated her • Later the hospital staff approached him to sign on some paper which he refused

		<p>km through the forest after speaking with his wife</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • He spent the entire night borrowing money, and went back the next morning to find that his wife was lying dead with her abdomen swollen, the ANMs were nowhere around 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation to the family
<p>Case of C. w/o Shivpoojan, 35 years, fifth pregnancy, Dalit Chitrakoot</p>	<p>Maternal death 30 November 2008</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Was feeling well enough to cook, feed her family and eat a meal before going to the PHC with the ASHA • Was taken into labour room by ASHA, ANM and dai (no doctor present) and later the ASHA said, the baby was extracted by force, leading to heavy bleeding • An hour later the staff asked for money (for sweets as a boy was born and medicines as she was not well), but by then she was actually dead • ASHA mentions 'a bucket of blood': she died instantly of massive bleeding but there was no facility to save her life • Body was not sent for post-mortem • No accountability of hospital staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When she died, the family was not informed, they were misled about the successful delivery of a boy, and asked to 'take her home' • The dead body was kept outside the hospital by the staff • The husband was offered a job by the doctor and local politicians to hush up the matter • The baby died in 15 days • The family have spent Rs 4000 and are in deep in debt (landless labourer with four children) • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation • A lawyer husband of one ASHA arranged a compromise with the doctor, out of which the husband got 1000. The husband also paid the lawyer Rs 1500 for fighting the case.
<p>Case of N. w/o Harilal , 27 years, fifth pregnancy,</p>	<p>30 December 2008 – 3 January 2009</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attended the local PHC for ANC and had to pay for each service • She had watery discharge for final three months of pregnancy which was not 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The private nursing home performed some surgical procedure (C-section or episiotomy) for the operation and demanded 6500/- for which the family had

<p>Backward caste, Sant Kabir Nagar</p>		<p>detected by the health worker who examined her (ASHA)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nurse at the PHC asked the family to buy drugs of Rs 300 • Nurse administered an IV line - no mention of supervision from a doctor • Only on the third day was she referred to another hospital – family travelled on their own for 12 Km to private Merrygold Hospital (no referral transport support) • Merrygold Hospital turned them away and they had to travel on their own again to a nursing home in the Gorakhpur city (no referral transport support) • The private nursing home is run by the doctor who works in the district hospital, and she insisted that they would need a C-section. • She took Rs 6500 for the delivery • After the delivery by “small operation” the woman continues to suffer post-partum complications which have not been detected or treated by the health system 	<p>to borrow from a money-lender</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ANM has charged money for all ante-natal care provided • The family did not benefit from the JSY money although they attended an institution for childbirth
<p>Case of J. w/o Rizwan, 35 years, fifth pregnancy, extremely poor, Saharanpur</p>	<p>Maternal death on 20 February 2009</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nurse was initially not there at CHC at 5 am • Nurse asked the husband to buy the drugs for injecting • Nurse gave an injection without any prescription • After injecting the nurse left the woman without qualified attendant • Needed to call the nurse three times before she would come back to attend 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nurse slapped the woman • The family was kept out of the room, so that they would not know that the woman was dying • Nurse demanded 5000 Rs for services, insisted on taking 5000 even though they had to borrow heavily • After the woman was actually dead, the doctor and nurse were trying to take signatures on documents without the

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Application of fundal pressure during labour 	<p>husband knowing his wife was dead, or without his knowledge of what was written</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • They even got his thumb-impression on documents after drugging him • Husband was offered money and a job to hush up the matter, even pressure from a political leader • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation
Case of C. w/o Keshav, 23 years, Dalit, fourth pregnancy Banda	Unwanted sterilization and lack of abortion access, 20 February 2009	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Was seeking an abortion at the local CHC; but was sterilized without consent or information, and no abortion was done • Has not received any counseling for contraception (fourth and unwanted pregnancy) • She had a difficult pregnancy due to the sterilization, had nausea and a sensation of gas. She couldn't walk at all after 6 months due to swelling and pain. • They took treatment from the same CHC, had to buy medicines for Rs 3000/- for which they took a loan from various sources • During labour, they went to same CHC at 6am, and had to pay Rs 600 to get 6 injections to augment the labour pains for 3 hours (injections were directly given IM, without any medical supervision) • She had pain in her sterilization stitches for 1 more month, and had difficulty in sitting 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Non-consensual sterilization • Denial of safe abortion services at the CHC • No responsibility taken by health providers for this action • Threats to the couple for attempting to seek justice through complaints • No grievance redressal from government till date • Suffered a lot during pregnancy, perhaps due to the sterilization • Spent enormously for her treatment during pregnancy, and are deep in debt to a money lender and his employer • Had to pay money to the staff at the CHC for routine care in delivery

<p>Case of R. w/o Santosh, second pregnancy, 26 years, Dalit, Azamgarh</p>	<p>Maternal death, 26 March 2009</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has attended CHC for regular ANC • Went back there during labour, had to call the ANM out from home (no mention of doctor) • ANM asked them to buy injections from the market, for which the ASHA worker took Rs500 from the family and took the prescription • ANM administered an injection without medical supervision; baby was born normally at 11.20 am • The placenta was not expelled for the next 15-20 minutes; for which the ANM used forceps and tried to forcibly remove it • As placenta came out, she started bleeding heavily, for which the ANM once again wrote a prescription for which again the ASHA took Rs 500 to buy medicines • ANM administered another injection but heavy bleeding continued, to the extent that the blood was apparent in the drain outside • No message was given to the family, the gate was closed. (The husband quickly got cloth for the bleeding, but by the time he managed to enter the room and see her, she was weeping and could no longer speak, and collapsed immediately. • The hospital staff compelled them to take the woman to another doctor (although she was already dead at 12.20 pm) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • She went back to her own CHC for her delivery but did not get to see a doctor, only an ANM who was not skilled in managing any complication or emergency • The action performed by the ANM (using forceps to manually remove the placenta) caused the uncontrolled bleeding leading to her death • Although they are extremely poor, they are compelled to buy essential medicines from the market • The family was not informed immediately that it was a medical emergency • The family was kept outside a closed door so that the woman was alone during her dying moments • After the death, the husband was surrounded by the staff and intimidated into signing a document he had not read or understood • The hospital staff compelled the family to take the dead woman to another doctor (perhaps hoping to avoid the accusation of the death having occurred at their hospital) • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation to the family (instead they spent Rs 1000 on medicines) • After 15 days the ASHA gave him a bearer cheque for JSY money of Rs 1400, advised him to encash it with the help of any woman, and took away the MCH Card. Thus
--	--------------------------------------	--	--

			there is no record of the woman having died according to government records
Case of N. w/o Mustaqeem, 35 years, fifth pregnancy, Muzaffarnagar	Maternal Death on 3 May 2009	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • She had watery discharge during late pregnancy and went to the PHC but doctor did not treat her • After around 8 days, went back to PHC • Nurse asked them to buy injections • The baby was born within 2 hours (Oxytocin use?) • Baby died within a few minutes; doctor said it had passed 'stools'/meconium within the uterus a few days ago • Within another two hours, she was bleeding heavily so they sent her away to the distt CHC, for which the family had to pay Rs 500 for the vehicle • She died at 8 pm before reaching the CHC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • She went to a PHC for her health problem but was denied medical care in time; thus lost the baby • Despite attending an institution, she was not treated in time for her heavy bleeding, thus leading to loss of life • She was referred out without support, although her condition was critical • The husband was threatened that a death enquiry would mean exhumation of the corpse • Family spent a total of Rs5000, and will be in debt as they are landless labourers with 4 children • No post-mortem, • No death audit or review • No grievance redressal mechanism • No compensation